

**INDOCTRINATION TOWARD CHINESE WOMAN IN 19<sup>TH</sup> CENTURY  
REFLECTED IN THE NOVEL THE SNOW FLOWER AND THE SECRET FAN  
BY LISA LEE:  
FEMINIST APPROACH.**

**Chika Ellvan Reisyer\*, Winda Eviyanto\*\***

\*Students of English Department, Putera Batam University

\*\*Lecturer of English Department, Putera Batam University

*e-mail: pb161210038@upbatam.ac.id*

**Abstract**

*Indoctrination as a form of the limit of women's space which they cannot feel any space of theirs has been restricted because of the traditions that exist in their community. This is reflected to the novel that the researcher will analysis the snow flower and the secret fan written by Lisa Lee. It is represented by the women as the agents of the event, which is they feel that they have to do their custom tradition just to make them look valuable, and this system puts men on the highest rank in the hierarchy roles in the family. This research is done by applying the concept of Barbara Welter which is the concept of woman which said that woman's movement is being limited by their culture and also by using descriptive qualitative method. In this novel, the indoctrination divided into four parts which is the submissiveness, domesticity, purity and piety. This snow flower and the secret fan is also a representation of feminism because The space of movement in this novel is stricted due to its patriarchal system.*

**Keywords:** *Indoctrination, Feminist, The snow flower and the secret fan, Patriarchal culture systems.*

**INTRODUCTION**

"I also understood that two Confucian ideals ruled our lives. The first was the Three Obediences: "When a girl, obey your father; when a wife, obey your husband; when a widow, obey your son." The second was the Four Virtues, which delineate women's behavior, speech, carriage, and occupation: "Be chaste and yielding, calm and upright in attitude; be quiet and agreeable in words; be restrained and exquisite in movement; be perfect in handiwork and embroidery." If girls do not stray from these principles, they will grow into virtuous women. (Lee, 2005,p.24)"

The quote above explained one of the example which is about the rules for women by their patriarchal culture. By the rules of women in the society they will not feel that their status as a women is being stricted and think they have to do it because

it's their custom rules. According to Barbara Welter's Theory (Welter, 1966), the concept of the indoctrination which about the space of woman being limited unconsciously by their patriarchal system, which is reflected in the novel by Lisa Lee. This novel telling us the treatment of women in Chinese society where woman should only bear sons for it makes their life fortunate and easier and loved by their husband and in-law families. The value of women depends on how many sons she has and her obedience toward her husband's family. Not only that, the foot-binding process is also a sign that Chinese women's life is under the control of men and society since their childhood.

Snow Flower and the Secret Fan is a Novel written by Lisa See, an American born in Paris on February 18<sup>th</sup> 1955 and spent most of her years in Chinatown, Los Angeles. The writer took this novel to be analyzed because it reflects feminist in Chinese women around their society in the 18<sup>th</sup>-19<sup>th</sup> century, which its also tells a story about Chinese history in the 18<sup>th</sup>-19<sup>th</sup> century. So, it makes the writer interested in reading this novel and also analyzing it. Lisa Lee write this novel according to the history of the story which happened in the 19 century. the novel has been made into a movie later on.

This novel describe the culture of the Chinese in the 18<sup>th</sup> – 19<sup>th</sup> century. women in that time has

attached to their customs tradition and has to follow it. For one Example of their tradition is arranged married, there is no love between the couple in this marriage, and also the groom will be choosed by the matchmaker. The bride will be treated as a stranger until they got into pregnant. Furthermore, having a daughter is considered as a burden and worthless beings as the family will feed them until they grow up and get married. The will be leaving as soon as they are pregnant and not taking care of her parents after then. The hierarchy roles in the family puts women with less sons and unmarriage girls into the lowest rank than a servant. Other tradition is showed where they must not eat when they are getting marriage, they couldn't eat for 10 days just to look pure towards their future in law family. However, Lily the main main character of the novel follow things like the in examples above without resisting, because it is their custom tradition she have to follow. From this, we can indicate that lily is the representation of the women whom their motion is being strict by their custom laws, and described as Indoctrination.

The patriarchal system in China is influenced by Confucianism. Confucianism which explain the social ethics that rules the life of people in the society. Men and women should act according to the hierarchy of social rules in which women is in the lowest position. A women should act according to the doctrine of Confucianism. And they are taught to always prioritize and obey men whether it's a father, son or husband.

Previous research that has analyzed Indoctrination is written by Arianto (2018) entitled *Indoctrination Against Women In The Lowland By Jhumpa Lahiri*. This journal highlight the indoctrinations towards Indian women who strongly attached to their traditions in society. The other journals has not been found but its inspiring enough help the researcher complete the research. Such as *Woman in Patriarchal Culture : Gender Discrimination and Intersectionality Portrayed in Bob Darling* by Rejeki (2017) which talking about gender discrimination especially towards women. Gender and class society has been described here which can inspire the research to complete the research.

### **Formulation of the Problem**

Based on the limitation of the problem above, the formulation of the problems formulated as followed:

1. What are the aspects of indoctrination represented towards the women in the Snow Flower and the Secret Fan novel?
2. What are the patriarchal cultures that represented in the novel?

### **Objectives of the research**

Related to the formulation of the problems, the objectives of the research are proposed as follows:

1. To find out about the aspects of indoctrination in the Snow Flower and the Secret Fan novel.
2. To explain about the patriarchal culture system in the novel.

## **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURES AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK**

### **Theory of Feminist**

Feminist approach is known as feminist literary criticism. According to Culler (1986) "The feminist literary critics can be divided into two groups: as Anglo American feminist literary critics in "images of women" and "images of writer"". As Showalter (1985) added that "The two types of feminist literary criticism. The first sees women as readers that focuses on the study of the image and stereotype of women in literature, while the second who see women as writers examine the history of women's literature, female writer's creativity, women's writing profession as a society, and the development and regulation of women's writers." Millett (1970) in her *Sexual Politics* stated that The aim of feminist literary critics was to promote a positive image of women in art and therefore in life, and also to raise the consciousness of women to their own oppression. The method pursued by Millett is to look at how female characters are portrayed and in what positions/situations they are placed in 'great' literary works."

### **Theory of Patriarchy and Patriarchy In China**

Madsen (2000) in *Feminist Theory and Literary Practice* stated that:

"Patriarchy is a cultural (ideological) system that privileges men and all things masculine, and a political system that places power in the hands of men and thus serves male interests at the expense of women".

A Patriarchy, is a society where the male elders has the power to control what belong to them. When modern historians and sociologists describe a "patriarchal society," they mean that men hold the positions of power and have more privilege: head of the family unit, leaders of social groups, boss in the workplace and heads of government. In patriarchy, there is also a hierarchy among the men. The concept of patriarchy has been central to Feminist theories. According to Karima (2006), Patriarchal is a system which have to do with the cultural systems and economic that gives priority and power to men and also indirectly gives the power to make women into the lower place than the men. Patriarchal is different such in the system of their bloodline through their father to their sons. Patriarchal is not only

supported only male but female also supported it, example such as when a mother teaches her daughter how to be obedient to her father or their husband.

In a Chinese Patriarchy, the culture has been construct by the Confucian systems to control how they lived. Based on the Confucianism, men is on the highest rank of the hierarchy roles in the family, as Leng (1989) stated that “the clan or a household, the men held authority and decision making power, it makes women were their subordinate. The man controlled the family finances and made the decision of family affairs”. Because of this culture system, the women have to respect their husband, fathers, brothers and other elders. They also have to follow the rules made by the Confucianism. If they didn't do it, they will be considered without virtue or abused by men. In order to making the women stay at home, Chinese culture in that era creates the standard of beauty for women which is the foot-binding.

Marriage in China is also part of the culture, as Leng (1989) stated that “In traditional China, marriage was arranged by the parents and often through a mediator or go-between, without the consent of the young people concerned. There was no romantic love, no dating, and no courtship in mate selection for it was feared that the free choice of a partner would threaten the dominance of parental affection, loyalty, and authority.” If the female didn't like their future husband, she cannot resist or avoid him, they have to obey their custom tradition. Marriage in their culture is to have only to have sons, their daughter in law or wife will bear sons for them, because women is considered not valuable in their culture.

### **Theory of Indoctrination**

In this research the writer will be explaining about what happened in the 19<sup>th</sup> century in china. Which is about the patriarchal system culture known as Confucianism which has been implemented in each of the women in the Chinese society. In the analyzing the research, the researcher use the indoctrination as a form of the limit of women's space which they cannot feel any space of theirs has been restricted because of the traditions that exist in their community. There are some kinds of aspects of women found by Welter (1966) which are.

#### **1. Submissiveness**

Submissiveness is one of the concept where it explains about someone who has the power to dominate or make rules to influence people's behaviour. Submissiveness can be found in someone who has a higher status in the family or social class in the society. This concept has made

the person is being controlled by someone or became a restrained person.

#### **2. Purity**

Purity is the second concepts where it explained about the women that should have something in themselves such as manner or the beauty of the woman. Without having a purity the women will be considered as unmannered. Or we can say that without manner the women didn't have any talent to be with someone. Purity is considered as important as piety for a woman.

#### **3. Piety**

While submissive is explaining about someone with power in charge and purity is about manner or beauty of the women, piety is the third concept where it explained about norms, traditions and religions. Piety can be found in most of the patriarchal research because of their marriage concept and the traditions in a certain feminism literature. Barbara Walter Said that through piety women is considered to have a dignity. In Indoctrination Norms and Traditions are viewed as a gift from god that should be obeyed by the people.

#### **4. Domesticity**

In the last concepts of Welter (1966), Domesticity is a concept where it explained about women matter relating to the household they were in. Such as a house chores. The women have to know to do chores. Not only chores but they also have to listen to what the elder in their house or where they at want them to do. In a patriarchal system, women are told to serve men, especially in the roles of the kitchen in the household.

### **Previous Study**

The journals which explained about indoctrination has not been found, but the the other journals is inspiring enough help the researcher complete the research.

*Woman in Patriarchal Culture : Gender Discrimination and Intersectionality Portrayed in Bob Darling* by Rejeki (2017) which talking about gender discrimination especially towards women. Gender and class society has been described here which can inspire the research to complete the research. The article tells about class society where the women

The Third Journal is written by Rakhmyta (2018) with the title “*Femininity Aspect As Reflected In Lisa See's Snow Flower And The Secret Fan*” There are also similarities and differences too. The similarity is that the article is analyzing the same novel the research design by using Qualitative method. The differences is that the analyzing is only analyze the oppression of Chinese women in the 19<sup>th</sup> century and also how they secluded their life to

survive in the patriarchal culture. The researcher took the novel as an inspiration on making the research and also helping her to complete this thesis paper.

## **METHOD OF THE RESEARCH**

In this chapter, it describe the research methodology used to complete the research. The researcher is also will explain the steps to solve the problem in the formulation of the research.

### **Research Design**

Research design is aimed to find data to be analyzed. The data research is aimed to be used for understanding the data and solve the data. The researcher uses a qualitative method. Qualitative method is a method where the researcher will have to take and describe the data from the utterance or sentences. According to Sugiyono (2018), So the researcher will be reading the novel by Lisa Lee that describes the indoctrination happened in their patriarchal culture system in the 19th century.

it is telling us about the women in the young age whose going through into a various process of pain and also need to be obedience when they grew up. When they grew up they will have to get married with the man through arranged marriage, and being told to do something since it's their custom tradition. They have the lowest place than a servant even thought they got married, their rank will increase according to how many sons they gave birth to and how obedience they were to their in law families. While man in this novel is considered important than a female in which they cherish a son and a man so much than a girl, because a girl is considered as a worthless being and useless being. From this object of the study, the researcher will find the indoctrination based on Barbara Welter's concept which it have 4 kinds of concept which is Submissiveness, purity, piety and domesticity.

### **Object of the study**

Object of the research is an attribute or character of people Sugiyono (2018) Object of the research is the problem that found by the researcher to be analyzed and concluded by the researcher. In order to determine the object of this research, the researcher had read some novels and the The Snow Flower and the secret fan succeed to make the researcher interested in analyzing it.

### **Method of Collecting Data**

To answer each formulation problems, the researcher collected data from the books, journals, and internet. There are two sources that will be used for the research. The first one is the novel "snow flower and the secret fan" itself and the second sources are the books, journals, and internet. These sources will be used as the reference to analysis the

topic. Document of study means from collecting the data through pictures, literary works and so on Sugiyono (2018).

There are few steps that the researcher will use. The primary data came from the novel entitled The Snow Flower and the secret fan and the researcher will read the novel and make herself understand about the story of the novel then collect the data. The secondary data is taken from some references such as internet, journals, books to help the researcher analyze her topic that has been explained in the formulation, it includes theoretical, approaches that will be needed for her topic.

### **Method of Analyzing Data**

The method of analyzing data includes 3 main steps In this step the data will be analyze by using qualitative descriptive method where the first step is to analyze the preliminary which is intrinsic elements Welter (1966) the third will be analyzing the Patriarchal culture by Madsen (2000) in the novel. And then will be making the conclusion.

### **Method of Presenting Data**

According to Sugiyono (2018) the most frequent form of displaying data for qualitative research is by using text. So, result of the research is presented by qualitative-descriptive method. The data is reporting qualitatively. It means that the research is conveyed by using the form of words or paragraphs to deliver the research. The researcher use this method because the researcher uses the sentences and paragraphs to explain clearly about the result of the research

## **RESEARCH ANALYSIS AND FINDING**

In this research analysis, the data were discussed with the formulated research question. The Indoctrinations are analyzed based on Welter (1966).

### **The concepts of indoctrinations**

The researcher will continue to the main analysis which is the indoctrination and patriarchal culture. According to Welter (1966), through indoctrination a women will not feel that her space of action has been restricted, it is because of their custom traditions in the society and family, it is said restricted because they think that they have to do it because its their custom traditions which is patriarchal system. There are four kinds Concepts of indoctrination. These four aspects describe the experience of Chinese women in the novel in their culture tradition.

#### **1. Submissiveness**

To obey someone or being controlled by someone or something is the definition of

submissiveness explained by Welter (1966). As the main character Lily and the other women characters live in a patriarchal culture system, they have to follow what the elder a man or their system said. The quote shown below about the behavioral system for women:

**“I also understood that two Confucian ideals ruled our lives.** The first was the Three Obediences: “When a girl, obey your father; when a wife, obey your husband; when a widow, obey your son.” The second was the Four Virtues, which delineate women’s behavior, speech, carriage, and occupation: “Be chaste and yielding, calm and upright in attitude; be quiet and agreeable in words; be restrained and exquisite in movement; be perfect in handiwork and embroidery.” If girls do not stray from these principles, they will grow into virtuous women. (Lee, 2005,p.24)”

The patriarchal system in China is influenced by Confucianism. Confucianism which explain the social ethics that rules the life of people in the society. Men and women should act according to the hierarchy of social rules in which women is in the lowest position. A women should act according to the doctrine of Confucianism. And they are taught to always prioritize and obey men whether it’s a father, son or husband. Other than the quote above, the writer found another quote which describe submissiveness as it shown below:

“All three of us tried to rip our bindings, but only Third Sister actually freed a foot. Mama beat her on her arms and legs, rewrapped the foot, and made her walk an extra ten rounds across the room as punishment. Over and over, **Mama shook her roughly and demanded,** “Do you want to become a little daughter-in-law? It’s not too late. That future can be yours. (Lee, 2005,p.29)”

As the second quote show that the mother of lily was doing the binding process to her daughters, in where the youngest daughter freed her feet from the binding because, the novel said that the binding felt like a torture, they have to walk again and again until their toes are broken or simple way to say that

until their feet bones are broken. Since the youngest freed her bindings and her mother knew, the mother hit her and punished her by ordering her to walk again and again. Karima (2006) stated that Patriarchal is not only supported by male but female also supported it, example such as when a mother teaches her daughter how to be obedient.

In this case the submissiveness came from her mother where she ordered her daughter to walk even though she also knew its painful to them, the mother did this to make her daughters have values in themselves. Since their tradition said that the foot-binding is the symbol of beauty or obedience, as the mother said “the future can be yours”. The next quote showed that the symbol of foot-binding to them:

“My small feet would be offered as proof to my prospective in-laws of my personal discipline and my ability to endure the pain of childbirth, as well as whatever misfortunes might lie ahead. **My small feet would show the world my obedience to my natal family, particularly to my mother, which would also make a good impression on my future mother-in-law.** The shoes I embroidered would symbolize to my future in-laws my abilities at embroidery and thus other house learning. (Lee, 2005,p.33)”

In the case of foot-binding, the women followed the tradition just to make the have the value to themselves because in their patriarchal system, women or unmarried girls are considered not having any value, so they have to follow what their tradition wants them to do, as the quote shown that the foot-binding gives them the proof of themselves being discipline, obedient and abilities. Indoctrination here showed through Lily’s Mother in which is Indoctrination Patriarchal from Mother or a female. After the women get married then pregnant, they will have to move to their in law family. They have to obey and listen to mostly their mother in law because the mother in law made the rules in the domestic place.

In this case, mother in law is in the second rank of the hierarchy in the family and also the mother of her husband. As the quote below showed that they have to build a relationship with her mother in law, the mother of her husband:

**“As in most marriages, the most important person for me to build a relationship with was my mother-in-law.** Everything Snow Flower had

told me about Lady Lu following the usual conventions was true. She watched over me as I did the same chores that I did in my natal home—making tea and breakfast, washing clothes and bedding, preparing lunch, sewing, embroidering, and weaving in the afternoon, and finally cooking dinner. **My mother-in-law ordered me about freely.** (Lee, 2005,p.128)”

As the above explained, the quote showed that the women in her in law house have to make a good relationship between her mother in law. In order to make it happen they have to listen and do what their mother in law ordered them to do. Even if they didn't like them or even if their mother in law is strict or evil, they have to obey and listen to them. They did this so that from the view of her mother in law she is worth it to be in the family. By doing the things that their in law ordered or by watching them, the women build a good relationship. After explaining about obeying the in law family, since the newly married women and has the lowest rank in the family. Making a good relationship in the in law family is not only by doing chores that the mother in law ordered them to do, but also according on how many sons of the daughter in law can give the family. Such like in the quote above that the research found in the other main character which is Snow Flower:

“My mother-in-law says, “Why did we marry you **in if not to bear sons?**” My husband says, “You are young. You will have more children. **Next time you will bring me a son.**” (Lee, 2005,p.150)”

The previous quote and the next one showed that the submissiveness came from the in law family. Which is from a husband and mother in law:

“I like to sing when I wash the clothes or bring in the firewood, but my husband gets angry if he hears me. **When he is displeased, he won't permit me to cross over the threshold for anything other than my chores. If he is happy, in the evening he lets me sit outside** on the platform where he kills his pigs. (Lee, 2005,p.146)

The quote above showed that the in law family demand sons more than daughters. It is not showed

to obey but from the sound of the words is like ordering Snow flower to bear for sons not daughters. Her husband will asked her to do bed business more often and she have to obey the decision, since the family is more superior to her. So from submissiveness, there researcher conclude that it came from the mother and the in law family where they have to obey and listened to them in anything they wants them to do. It is because they are more superior to them and it is also one of their custom to obey someone who is older than them which mother in law is the mother of her husband and have to respect her and listen to her, while mother is in the second rank of the hierarchy rank because she have most son and also a husband who is a man that must be obeyed. Even if they didn't like them, example like Lily did to her mother she have to obey her still to keep her filial piety. They have to obey even if it costs their body and feeling.

## 2. Purity

A concept where it explained about manner and beauty of a women in which they should have is the definition of Purity explained by Welter (1966). A mother tends to care about her family and love them. In the 19<sup>th</sup> century mother tends to maintain their children until the day of her marriage. In the novel, purity is represented by Lily's mother and Lily. In which the quote below shown about Lily's mother:

**“A true lady lets no ugliness into her life,”** she repeated again and again, drilling the words into me. **“Only through pain will you have beauty. Only through suffering will you find peace.** I wrap, I bind, but you will have the reward. (Lee, 2005,p.30)”

The quote above showed what the mother said to her daughter while she was doing the binding process to her daughter. Which means through pain you will find a better life and through suffering you will have a better future, in which the mother showed the care for her daughters only from being strict and abusive. They have to harden their feeling.

Bonventre (2005) stated that without purity women will lose their identity as a women, not being loved by the opposite gender and a lower form of being, in which purity has become a form of indoctrination. According to Fajriyatul (2018) , Chinese culture in that era creates the standard of beauty for women which is the foot-binding. In which the foot-binding became a symbol how marriageable they were in which they started the binding at the age of five and six years old, because her feet bones are still soft which it didn't view the class of each women. Like the quote shown below in which the small feet is more important than their face:

“Madame Wang spoke. **“The girl is indeed very lovely, but golden lilies are far more important in life than a pretty face.** A lovely face is a gift from Heaven, but tiny feet can improve social standing. On this we can all agree. What happens beyond that is really for Father to decide.” (Lee, 2005,p.18)”

“All I knew was that foot-binding would make me more marriageable and therefore **bring me closer to the greatest love and greatest joy in a woman’s life—a son.**” (Lee, 2005,p.26)”

As the quote showed that, the pair of small feet is more important than having a pretty face. Other than a symbol of how marriageable they are, it is also to bring them a good life in the future, because the small feet would determine their social values. The more small feet is in perfect shape, the more guarantee future they have. As small feet became their beauty standard, the family that came from rich family will want their daughter in law has a perfect shape of small feet.

According to their tradition if the feet is not bounded, the girl is useless or not valuable, and often being sold in the market or give them to other family just to bear children. They will think that by foot-binding, they are considered as a true women which is leading them to being loved by in law family and showed how obedience they were. The quote below shown is the result of the foot-binding did by the mother to her six years old daughter, it’s when she sees her third daughter dying because of the torment pain that her third daughter feel.

“You know that’s the worst thing,” Aunt came back. “Many of her bones have already broken. If you don’t bind them, they will never heal properly. She’ll be crippled. Unmarriageable.” **“I would rather keep her on this earth unmarried than lose her forever.** “Then she would have no purpose and no value,” Aunt reasoned. “Your mother love tells you this is no future.” (Lee, 2005,p.32)”

From the quote above, it is showed that Lily’s mother regretting and sad from doing the foot-binding as in result her daughter died from it, as the story quote continues that the mother and the rest of

the family mourn the death of the third daughter. As in the story later on where Lily has become a mother in which she does the same thing to her daughter:

“Though my daughter’s bones and disposition were pliant, she wept piteously. **I could not stand it, though we had only just begun. I took my feelings and harnessed them,** driving my daughter back and forth across the floor of our upstairs room, wrapping her bindings ever tighter on those days that her feet were rewrapped, and chastising her—no, crying bitterly at her— with what my mother had drilled into me. (Lee, 2005,p.202)”

As the quote above showed that about Lily does the foot-binding to her daughter as what her mother taught her when she was little. She knew the exact feeling of pain that her Daughter Jade felt. As a mother, Lily felt sad because her daughter felt the same painful as hers because of the foot-binding. When Lily was just a little girl, she considered her mother as a bad women in which only to satisfy her desire by doing the bindings, but now she knew what her mother felt when her mother did the binding to her. In which women do not have any other option they should follow the existing rule in the society.

In which the first indoctrination came when the mother whose care for her daughter have to do their tradition about the foot-binding process to their daughter because she thinks that she must do it so that her daughters will have value and they showed their love by being strict to her daughter and hardened their feeling towards their daughter. The second indoctrination came from Lily in which she has to suffer by feeling the painful process of foot-binding and she have to hold the pain because she think it was one of their tradition that they must accept just to find love and beauty and later on as a mother she felt sad because she has no other option just to make her own daughter to feel something that she have felt before.

### 3. Piety

Welter (1966) stated that Piety which deals with norms, religion and tradition in the novel, through piety women will think that the rules came from god in which they cannot reject or say no to it, so they must follow the rules. In the Novel, one of dogma found such as in marriage traditions in which Lily should follow the custom system of arranged married where her family will ask a matchmaker to find a groom for her daughter:

**“She arranged for me to be married into the best Lu family in Tongkou.** My husband’s uncle was a jinshi scholar, who had received much land from the emperor as an enfeoffment. Uncle Lu, as he was called, was childless. (Lee, 2005,p.62)”

The quote above Determine Piety which came from their tradition which is arranged marriage, as we know that an arranged married is a marriage where there is no love between the couple and they got arranged by their family or the matchmaker. The bride also cannot eat in 10 days before her marriage because of her custom tradition to make them look pure towards her husband. The next custom tradition about the dowries:

“Snow flower and i turned fifteen. Our hair was pinned up in the style of phoenixes as symbols that we were soon to be married. **We worked on our dowries in earnest.** We spoke in soft voices. We walked on our lily feet in a graceful manner (Lee, 2005,p.75)”

As the quote above describe The Dowries from the girl’s side was made from the girl’s crafting for the in law family to use in her wedding day and also some of the material were from the in law family. The dowries are sent to the girl’s family as a bride prices in which it like they sold their daughter to the in law family. After the marriage, Lily will be sent back to their natal family and have to wait until they got pregnant so that they can move to their in law family. Even thought she will have a child, her status in the in law family is still in the lowest rank, in which they will need to have sons to increase the rank in the house. In the In law household, Lily has to obey her strict mother in law. Other than arranged married tradition, when her husband went away for a while, Lily is worried about herself of becoming a widow, as the quote showed above:

“From the moment my husband left, I worried. As the months wore on, I grew increasingly anxious and frightened. **If something happened to him, what would become of me? As a widow, I would have very few options. Since my children were too young to take care of me, my father-in-law could sell me away to another man. Knowing that**

**under those circumstances I might never see my children again, I understood why so many widows killed themselves.** (Lee, 2005,p.158)”

A husband is a life in the family, as the quote showed that what will happen if a husband died leaving his young family alone with children. As Lily said that no one will take care of her since her sons are still too young and the other option is that she will be sold to other man, she have to follow the rules without rejection since she belong to her husband’s family. As the next quote showed more further about widow:

**“The new widows, unable to bear the news, committed suicide: throwing their bodies over the cliff they had worked so hard to climb, swallowing burning embers from the evening fire, cutting their own throats, or slowly starving themselves. Those who didn’t take this path dishonored themselves even more by seeking new lives with other men around other fires.** It seemed that in the mountains some women forgot the rules about widowhood. Even if we are poor, even if we are young, even if we have children, **it is better to die, remain true to our husbands,** and keep our virtue than to bring shame on their memories. (Lee, 2005,p.182)”

The Quote showed that about the tradition where a women is a widow. Other than selling the widow to the other man where it will be considered as not being true to her late husband, the widow could kill herself as a symbol or prove to remain true and still keeping virtue of herself to her husband. When a husband died the wife will be considered don’t have any meaning anymore and her life in the in law family will be worthless. As the quote showed that “Yonggang informed me that Third Sister-in-law had been found dead earlier that morning. **She had killed herself** by swallowing lye. (Lee, 2005,p.162)”. The quote is an example taken from the novel, where the sister in law committe suicide since she lost her sons and husband in a disease, her mother in law became mean to her and said she’s worthless because she can’t take care of her husband and sons, and wanting the sister in law to die because she lost her husband and sons.



#### 4. Domesticity

Domesticity is a concept where it deals with women's matter such in what they should do in the house. A women will be considered unfemmine or unnatural if they went outside the world. If the domestic needs are not fulfilled, the women will be at the blame by her husband or entire family (Welter, 1966). The effect of the Confucianism where women should be in the house and take care of the domesticity activities, Such as the quote below said:

**"Whether you are rich or poor, emperor or slave, the domestic sphere is for women and the outside sphere is for men.** Women should not pass beyond the inner chambers in their thoughts or in their actions. (Lee, 2005,p.24)"

From the quote above we can conclude that a women should be in the house in which they should learn about something or do something to make a man felt safe after they came back from the outside working in which its clearly divided the role of men and women in the household. Welter (1966) in Bonventre (2005) stated that a women is fragile and she forced herself to do what her weakness brought her, she has to be concerned mostly to her family. As the quote below showed the Mother of Lily who devote herself to her family.

**"My mother was exhausted. She had five children, three of us five and under. She had the full responsibility of the household—cleaning, washing, and repairing, cooking all our meals, and keeping track of the household debts as best as she could. She had a higher status than Aunt, but she could not fight every day for what she believed was proper behavior. (Lee, 2005,p.16)"**

Since the mother concerned mostly to her family, she wants her daughter to know about house learning since they're girls and soon to be a mother after they got married. And they have to do what women should do in the house to make themselves worth it to be in their law family by doing the chores that she taught to her daughter by which Lily knows the rules of women from her mother The quote below said when the girls of the family started to learn the house learning taught by her mother and aunt:

**"My studies now branched out to include the practical arts. I learned how to thread a**

**needle, choose a thread color, and make my stitches small and even.** This was important, as Beautiful Moon, Third Sister, and I began working on the shoes that would carry us through the two-year foot-binding process. We needed shoes for day, special slippers for sleep, and several pairs of tight socks. We worked chronologically, starting with things that would fit our feet now and moving to smaller and smaller sizes. (Lee, 2005,p.24)"

The quote above showed that they learned how to make shoes for themselves before the foot-binding and later on the story explained that they will be making shoes for their in law family after they got matched by the matchmaker. The dowry itself came from the things that the girls made for the in law family, the women in the house only taught them how to do it, as the next quote showed them the next house learning:

**"Most important, my aunt began to teach me nu shu.** At the time, I didn't fully understand why she took a special interest in me. I foolishly believed that if I was diligent, I would inspire Beautiful Moon to be diligent too. Aunt instructed me on the special rules that govern nu shu. It can be used to write letters, songs, autobiographies, lessons on womanly duties, prayers to the goddess, and, of course, popular stories. (Lee, 2005,p.25)"

Nu Shu, is a poetical words where only women could understand, it was often used to send letters in the novel later on between Snow Flower and Lily. Since the women has no right to study and have literary things, they secretly begin to write nu shu to expresses themselves.

Men's writing takes a lifetime to learn and understand. Women's writing is something they pick up as girls, and they rely on context to coax meaning. Men write about the outer realm of literature, accounts, and crop yields. Women write about the inner realm of children, daily chores, and emotions. They never expected women to have emotions or express creative thoughts. The last quote showed that the house learning they have learned:

**“We helped around the house, sweeping, picking vegetables from the house garden, preparing meals, washing dishes and clothes, weaving, and sewing.** We were considered women, but we didn’t have the responsibilities of married women. (Lee, 2005,p.75)”

As the quotes above explained, the role of women is to do the house chores, Lily has been taught from the woman in the house in which she saw her mother tried hard to be a good housewife and always careful to act in order to make her father satisfy and be kind to her. As the quote showed that:

**“He sat down and waited to be served. I watched Mama closely as she wordlessly poured his tea.** I may have been afraid that she would notice me during her morning routine, **but she was even more mindful in her dealings with my father.** He rarely hit my mother and he never took a concubine, but her caution with him made us all heedful. (Lee, 2005,p.14)”

By doing a house chores they will be considered as a women who concerned about their family, and in the novel said that through doing the things that women should do in the house, their in law family will view themselves as a filial women who can support their family by making the house feels safe.

The indoctrination came from the confucianism where women should do the house chores just to look natural and true women, because they are women and they have to be in the kitchen. They have to follow what their custom rules since their custom wants women to be in the domestic sphere in which they have to learn about domestic chores since they are all just little girls in order to prevent any domestic violence from her husband in the future. Since the women can’t learn or know what’s outside world since their place is inside they write nu shu secretly to express their feeling. After they got married, they will need a permission from their husband or mother in law to go outside. If they go our or sneak to go outside without their in law permission, they will be considered as committing a crime.

### **Patriachal Culture**

“She looked at me the way all mothers look at their daughters—as a temporary visitor who was another mouth

to feed and a body to dress until I went to my husband’s home. I was five, old enough to know I didn’t deserve her attention, but suddenly I craved it. **I longed for her to look at me and talk to me the way she did with Elder Brother.** (Lee, 2005,p.13)”

As the the quote above showed, it showed us the patriachal culture indirectly which is men were superior than a women. A women is viewed as a burden to their family and also treated as a stranger to the house who will be leaving soon. According to the hierarchy rank, wome were put as the lowest rank. As the other quote showed that:

**“Miscarriages were common occurrences in our county, and women were not supposed to care if they had one, especially if the child was a girl. Stillbirths were considered dreadful only if the baby was a son.** If a stillborn child was a girl, parents were usually thankful. No one needed another worthless mouth to feed. (Lee, 2005,p.150)”

The quote above is the another example of patriarchy. Even thought it’s still a baby girl, it is still a women. A girl is not really needed in the family as it is said that its worthless to have a daughter in the house, which is a son is more important in the family. The patriachal Culture is shown by the confucianism system in which it controlled women. Women should keep the confucianism doctrine in their mind nand implement the rules into the society. As the writer read the novel, The writer fund 3 kinds of patriachal culture which is Domestic Violence, Footbinding, and Arranged Married.

### **1. Domestic Violence**

In patriachal Culture, women is considered a property when she is still unmarriage she will be considered as a property of her father and her father will have the power over her life. If she’s married, her life will belong to her husband’s family and doesn’t belong to her father anymore. Therefore since the wife is the propety of her husband, her husband will treat her freely as he wants it. In the novel, snow flower experienced the violance in a form of verbal by her husband, such as the quote below:  
She sighed.

“**“Because my husband says it is better to have a dog than a daughter.”** We all knew the truth of those words, but who would say that to his pregnant wife? (Lee, 2005,p.147)”

As we can see the quote above, it is a domestic violence in the form of verbal communication which a man said such stuff to his pregnant wife where he wants a son more than a daughter, the quote showed after snow flower lost her baby girl, so to her husband, its okay if the one who dies is a girl, he doesn't need a girl in the family who considered as useless beings. Not only her husband, but also her mother in law also said something awful to snow flower, but since snow flower is just a wife of her son, which mean that snow flower have to obey, and take it to her. The next quote showed the physical violence did by the butcher to snow flower:

"When Snow Flower asked where her son was buried, **the butcher turned and hit her with such ferocity that she flew back a couple of meters and landed with a thud onto the hard-packed snow. He proceeded to beat her so badly** that she miscarried in a violent gush of black blood that stained the icy slopes throughout our campsite. (Lee, 2005,p.186)"

As the quote above showed that, which snow flower's husband beat her violently after losing a son. Because the butcher needed sons, so when he lost a son he will go violent and when Snow flower did something wrong in her in law family, she will also got beaten by her husband. Since a wife is the property of her husband which they bought from giving dowries to women's family. The husband can do anything to her and treated freely as he wants. As for Snow flower, she know her position to her husband where she have to respect his decision even though it hurted her. She have to endure it. If she didn't respect her husband she will be considered as a unfilial women.

## 2. Foot-binding

"The poorest girls don't have their feet bound at all. We know how they end up. They are either sold as servants or they become "little daughters-in-law"—big-footed girls from unfortunate families who are given to other families to raise until they are old enough to bear children. **But in our so-so county, girls from families like mine begin their foot-binding at age six and it is considered done two years later**".<sup>18</sup>

At a very young age, women should have their feet bounded and turned into a small pair of feet which the small feet can determine their future. At the

age of six or seven, they got their feet bounded by their own mother. They will feel that they are not beautiful and attractive if they don't have the pair of small feet. The foot-binding is one of their standard beauty which they think from having the small feet they are accepted in the Chinese society. Foot-binding is also not only for beauty but also for their social status, the size of their feet determine how worth and valuable they are.

Fan Hong stated that "in order to have women completely in its control and its disposal, the Confucian-dominated society also invented and forced upon women an odd and appalling concept of feminine physical beauty – the small, bound foot (Hong, 1997:22)." The Confucian dominated society wanted women to be in domestic sphere, they create the foot-binding in order to make women stay at home. As how painful the foot-binding was and also made their body felt unbalance to do any work outside, which made them to stay at home and care for the domestic activities. From the foot-binding it divide the sphere between women and men in the society. As stated by Du Fangqin (Fangqin cited in Ping, 2000:43) "Foot-binding was one of men's conspiracies to keep women home as slaves physically and mentally, to turn them into sheer objects of men's lust and perversity."

As Ping (2000:32) in his *Aching for beauty – Footbinding in China* stated that "For upper-class women, foot-binding was the marker of their hierarchy. For girls from the lower class, foot-binding gave them an opportunity to move upward in the marriage and service market". Foot-binding is not only for the beauty standard for Chinese women or made them stayed at home, it also gives them a position of a rank and for the poor girls whose the binding in the perfect shapes, they will have the opportunity to make her life go better in the future.

## 3. Arranged Married

As Leng (1989:228) stated that "In traditional China, marriage was arranged by the parents and often through a mediator or go-between, without the consent of the young people concerned. There was no romantic love, no dating, and no courtship in mate selection for it was feared that the free choice of a partner would threaten the dominance of parental affection, loyalty, and authority." Arranged married is reflected from the main character which is Lily where she got arranged by a matchmaker in her village to marry a boy from the distance village which is in Tongkou. This marriage is not a love nor happiness marriage but a marriage just to continuing the man's family name by bearing a baby boy. As the quote showed below:

"As girls we are told that we are useless branches, because we will **not carry on our natal family names but only the names of the families we marry out to**, if we are lucky

enough to bear sons. In this way, a woman belongs to her husband's family forever, whether she is alive or dead. (Lee, 2005, p.227)"

The quote above showed that they were told useless, because they will leave the family after they got marriage and giving a baby boy to her in law family, because from a son, it can continue the family's name. since they always stayed at home because of their rules as a women, they cannot go out to find any man that they love, that's why they have to follow their custom rules which is arranged marriage.

## Research Finding

After completing the analysis research, the researcher found several data findings that describe the aspects of indoctrinations Welter (1966). Related to the Patriachal culture in the novel, each data of the aspects of indoctrination is showed in different ways trough the system. Chinese Patriachal culture Describe foot-binding (Ping, 2000), that can be explained in the aspects of *purity* the manner and beauty of a women without it they will feel unloved or lose their identity, in which chinese people view the small pair of feet as their beauty standard that they have to follow in which they have to feel the painful process of binding where their feet will be bound and were asked to walk again and again to make their bone broke just to be loved and have values. The second a mother that is known as a goddess to her child with her gentleness and care, has to harden her feeling by being strict to her child to do the binding because she have to follow the social tradition in the society

The second aspect is *Submissiveness* which is to be in controlled by someone or something (to obey), the foot-binding did by the mother is also a prove of their obedience to her family and later to her in law family, where they will be obeying her mother in law. Since they are living under their confucian rules where it doctrine that women should know where their place which they are in the lowest rank of the family so they have to obey their elders especially men. Mother in law is the mother of their husband means they need to obey it as they obey their husband. Women should listen to what their in law family wants them to do even if it cost their body and feeling. Breaking the rules that the family have will be considered as committing a crime.

The third aspect is *Domesticity* which make the woman should be in the house, and demanded to do what women should do in domestic sphere. as the the analyse above has been explained, their confucian rules doctrine that women should be in the domestic sphere and men in outer sphere which it has happened from the character Lily and the rest of the women from her household. They were put in the women's chamber since they were born and as soon

as they reached 3 to 5 years old, they will have to learn about domestic activity that will be taught by her mother or her aunt such as Sewing, washing, cooking, and so on. Nu Shu is a women writing about what they have experienced so they could express themselves. Men write about the outer realm of literature, accounts, and crop yields. Women write about the inner realm of children, daily chores, and emotions. The male in the house never expected women to have emotions or express creative thoughts, so with Nu Shu women will be able to send letter to each other without male knowing any meaning of the words their have written.

The fourth aspects is *Piety* which The fourth aspects is *Piety* where women can't reject or deny the rules because it came from god and they have to obey it. As the analyzing above from the patriachal culture such as arranged married where they got arranged by a matchmaker and cannot deny it, like it or not, they have to obey the rules. As the main character Lily reflected the arranged married where she got matched with a boy from the distance village by the matchmaker. The purpose of this arranged married is to continue the family name line by having a baby boy, so there is no love between the relationship.

## CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

### Conclusion

Based on the data analysis described in the 4<sup>th</sup> chapter, it was found the indoctrination towards chinese woman in the 19<sup>th</sup> century by Lisa Lee. The analysis used barbara welter's Approach found in her book cult of the womanhood. Through this indoctrination, a woman will feel that she must obey all of the ir traditions to be right in their society, example in the previous chapter which is about binding their feet into a smaller size. There are 4 konds of indoctrination aspects found in the novel, which is submissiveness, purity, piety, and domeaticity. The nove entitled "the snow flower and the secret fan by Lisa Lee" is a representation of feminism. Their space for action is limited due to the indoctrination with the label of norms, customs. Tradition and religion. Lily is represented as a figure who obeys the tradition even though it hurts for her while snow flower represented a bird in which she wants to be free but she is not so fortunate because she marries a butcher where she got beated and dies because she cannot hold anymore pain. The novel is a historical novel which the narrator is Lily where she told about her life since birth to old age.

The concept of indoctrinations in novel is viewed as the restriction for women which came from their own custom tradition that made them have to accept and do it. Their restriction came from their confucianism culture that made rules for women to obey a man. The patriachal system made them Submissiveness is how a women being controlled by

their system which is to obey a man, Purity where the women has been doctrine by their culture to have a small bound of feet which reflect how valueable they are and also the change attitude of a mother towards their daughter. Piety which they think the rules came from god and they have to do it and couldn't reject it such as in marriage and widowhood rules, and the last is domesticity where they have been doctrine by their culture that they must be inside the domestic sphere to take care the family, children, satisfy their husband and obey the in law family which is for a marriage women and learns about chores and stuff if they are unmarriage. They have been doctored by their Confucian rules or we can say that their patriarchal rules where they needs to obey a man at all cost. If they cannot do it they will be getting a domestic violence in a verbal form or physical form. If they went astray the confucian rules they will be considered as not being a true women and not deserve the love. In order to be loved they will have to obey and does their standard beauty which is foot-binding. Through foot-binding they will feel themselves as a true women whom has beauty and obedience. The women think that through the pain they have received from the bindings it will become a prove as they are all obedient. The bindings also determines their ranks in the society.

### Suggestion

This research is about the 4 concepts of indoctrinations towards Chinese women in the 19<sup>th</sup> which has been told in the novel entitled "the snow flower and the secret fan". The concepts of indoctrination are took from the patriarchal culture in the novel or known as Confucian rules. Where it doctrines about women in the society. For other researchers who want to analyze indoctrinations and patriarchal culture in their research, they should conduct their research on Indoctrinations.

### REFERENCES

- Arianto, T. (2018). INDOCTRINATION AGAINST WOMEN IN THE LOWLAND BY JHUMPA LAHIRI, *12(2)*, 153–166. <https://doi.org/10.19105/ojbs.v12i2.1935>
- Bonventre, L. (2005). *The Cult of True Womanhood: Women of the Mid-nineteenth Century and their Assigned Roles as Reflected in Contemporary Writing*.
- Culler, J. D. (1986). *On deconstruction : theory and criticism after structuralism*. Ithaca, N.Y. Retrieved from <https://archive.org/details/ondeconstruction00cull/page/n3/mode/2up>
- Fajriyatul, N. (2018). Female Subjectivity in Lisa See ' s Snow Flower and the Secret Fan, *108(SoSHEC 2017)*, 134–139.
- Hong, F. (1997). *Footbinding, Feminism and Freedom: The Liberation Of Women's Bodies In Modern China*. Psychology Press.
- Karima, F. H. (2006). *Analisis teks novel Anna and The King dengan Pendekatan Antropologi da Feminisme; Sikap Perlawanan Tokoh Utama terhadap Budaya Patriaki Kerajaan Siam*. Universitas Dipenogoro.
- Lee, L. (2005). Snow Flower and the Secret Fan. In *NOVEL*.
- Leng, S. (1989). *Changes in China: Party, State, and Society*. University Press of America.
- Madsen, D. L. (2000). *Feminist Theory and Literary Practice*. Pluto Press.
- Millett, K. (1970). *Sexual Politics*.
- Ping, W. (2000). *Aching for beauty: Footbinding in China*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Rakhmyta, Y. A. (2018). FEMININITY ASPECT AS REFLECTED IN LISA SEE'S SNOW FLOWER AND THE SECRET FAN, *2(1)*, 28–35. <https://doi.org/10.37249/as-salam.v2i3.109>
- Rejeki, R. I. (2017). Woman in Patriarchal Culture : Gender Discrimination and Intersectionality Portrayed in Bob Darling by, *1(2)*, 129–139. <https://doi.org/10.15408/insaniyat.v1i2.4345>
- Showalter, E. (1985). *The female malady: Women, madness, and English culture*. United States of America: Penguin Books.
- Sugiyono. (2018). *METODE PENELITIAN KUANTITATIF, KUALITATIF, DAN R&D*. Alfabeta.
- Welter, B. (1966). The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820-1860. *American Quarterly*, *Vol. 18, N.* <https://doi.org/10.2307/2711179>